

March 23, 2018

**Report to the**

**Trustees, Administration, Faculty, and Students**

**of**

**Borough of Manhattan Community College**

**By**

**An Evaluation Team Representing the  
Middle States Commission on Higher Education**

**Prepared after study of the institution's self-study report  
and a visit to the campus on March 11-14, 2018**

*The Members of the Team:*

*Dr. Donald Generals, President, Community College of Philadelphia*

*Ms. Valarie Avalone, Director of Planning, Monroe Community College*

*Prof. Gail Fernandez, Interim Dean of Assessment, Bergen Community College*

*Dr. Maris Lown, Vice President of Academic Affairs, Union County College*

*Mr. William D. Reuter, VP of Administration and Finance, Hudson Valley Community College*

*Dr. Rhonda M. Spells, VP Enterprise Technology and CIO*

*Dr. Linda Zanin, Program Director, Diagnostic Medical Sonography*

This report represents the views of the evaluation team as interpreted by the evaluation team, and it goes directly to the institution before being considered by the Commission.

It is a confidential document prepared as an educational service for the benefit of the institution. All comments in the report are made in good faith, in an effort to assist Borough of Manhattan Community College. This report is based solely on an educational evaluation of the institution and of the manner in which it appears to be carrying out its educational objectives.

## AT THE TIME OF THE VISIT

### President

Dr. Antonio Perez

### Chancellor

James B. Milliken, JD.

## I. Introduction

Borough of Manhattan Community College is a 2 year Associates degree granting institution. The College has a number of off campus sites where a limited number of classes are offered. BMCC has an expanding distance learning program and recently submitted a substantive change request.

The Middle States Evaluation Team Conducted an evaluation of Borough of Manhattan Community College (BMCC) as part of the College's decennial review. This evaluation report reflects the collective thinking of a team of trained peer reviewers. The evaluation and report were based on the Institution's Self-Study Report and a subsequent team visit.

The team was charged with examining the evidence in support of the College's Self-Study with judgments stemming from the degree to which the institution's practices were in compliance with the 7 Standards of the Middle States Commission on Higher Education (MSCHE) and the Requirements of Affiliation. Based upon our review, we sought to determine that the institution:

- Has a mission appropriate to higher education;
- Is guided by well-defined and appropriate goals, including goals for student learning;
- Has established conditions and procedures under which its mission and goals can be realized;
- Has resources appropriate to carry out its mission and goals,
- Assesses both institutional effectiveness and student learning outcomes, and uses the results for improvement;
- Is accomplishing its mission and goals substantially;
- Is organized, staffed, and supported so that it can be expected to continue to accomplish its mission and goals; and
- Meets the Requirements of Affiliation and accreditation standards of the Middle States Commission on Higher Education.

The team would like to thank Dr. Perez and the BMCC administration for its support and cooperation. The team would also like to thank the CUNY administration. We recognize the tireless work of the Self- Study Steering Committee and the related Working Groups. The team wants to give a special thanks to Dr. Christopher Shults for his logistical support and coordination. Finally, we would like to thank the entire college community for their input and candor throughout this process of self-reflection and continuous improvement.

## **II. Context and Nature of the Visit**

Borough of Manhattan Community College chose to use the Comprehensive Model for its self-study. The college's decision to integrate strategic planning into the self-study process provided the lens through which determinations about continuous improvement and, or, institutional effectiveness were made. The institution sought to examine its challenges through an exhaustive study of its internal operations, functions and educational systems. The self-study was aligned with the five goals in the institutional strategic plan and an overarching goal of achieving and monitoring student success: (1) Strengthen college readiness and improve the effectiveness of developmental education; (2) Improve the student experience; (3) Facilitate timely degree completion, graduation and transfer; (4) Prepare students for 21<sup>st</sup> century careers and contribute to workforce development in NYC.; (5) Cultivate institutional transformation, innovation and sustainability.

Borough of Manhattan Community College (BMCC) is the largest of 24 institutions comprising the City University of New York (CUNY). The College enrolls approximately 27,000 undergraduate students. The college has grown by 40% over the last 10 years. Its current 3 year graduation rate of 20.3 represents a 34% increase in 5 years.

## **III. Affirmation of Continued Compliance with Requirements of Affiliation**

Based on a review of the Certification Statement, the Self-Study, interviews and other institutional documents, the team affirms that the institution continues to meet the MSCHE Requirements of Affiliation as required by the Middle States Commission on Higher Education.

## **IV. Compliance with federal requirements; issues relative to state regulatory or other accrediting agency requirements.**

Based upon 3<sup>rd</sup> party review, the team was able to verify the College's compliance with federal requirements in the 8 required areas.

## **V. Evaluation**

The team commends Borough of Manhattan Community College for its willingness to be forthright about the status of the institution and related challenges. Team members found the faculty and staff to be dedicated professionals who were earnest in their comments and views. The team members were especially impressed with the students who were interviewed, the

student musicians at the opening reception and the student ambassadors who served as guides throughout the 3 day visit.

### **Standard I: Mission and Goals**

**The institution's mission defines its purpose within the context of higher education, the students it serves, and what it intends to accomplish. The institution's stated goals are clearly linked to its mission and specify how the institution fulfills its mission.**

#### Summary of Evidence and Findings

Based on a review of the self-study, other institutional documents, and interviews with faculty, staff, students, and others, the team developed the following conclusions relative to this standard:

BMCC has a clearly defined mission statement, institutional goals, strategic objectives and strategic planning outcomes. The objectives reflect specific actions to be taken to ensure progress towards achievement of the strategic goals, while the strategic plan outcomes are intended to indicate the expectations for improvement. The Institutional Effectiveness Report Card (Spring 2018) focuses on the outcomes. Baseline measures are from 2015-2016 with progress shown for 2016-2017.

- *Reaching Greater Levels: Strategic Plan 2015-2020*, was developed by a 13-member committee working with an independent consultant and hundreds of faculty, staff and students. It contains an updated mission statement and five (5) goals. Stakeholders had multiple opportunities for input. BMCC's strategic goals are the same as the new institutional goals.
- The mission and goals clearly demonstrate external as well as internal contexts and constituencies.
- The Strategic Plan is aligned and consistent with CUNY's Strategic Framework and the Performance Management Process. The mission statement was formally approved by the College Council and all members of the Academic Senate.
- The Plan is implemented through operational planning which annually documents progress towards achievement by individual departments and units. A review of the strategic objectives and outcomes demonstrates BMCC's focus on program and curriculum development as well as institutional and educational outcomes. The goals are supported by administrative, educational, and student support programs and services.
- The College's financial plan is the principal vehicle for resource allocation. Proposals for new funding should demonstrate a direct link to the College's strategic plan.
- Faculty and students engage in opportunities to conduct research. The Office of Research supports scholarly inquiry by providing assistance with grants, research, publications and navigation through the institutional review board (IRB) process. The Office of Sponsored Programs provides support to faculty and staff and ensures that BMCC maintains a diverse portfolio of grants that support research and scholarship directly connected with the institutional mission. Furthermore, the Center for Excellence in Teaching, Learning and Scholarship acts as a forum for faculty to develop as teachers and scholars.

- The mission and goals are publicized and appear to be known to the institution’s internal stakeholders. There is a link to the Strategic Plan on BMCC’s homepage and another under “About BMCC.”
- To ensure that BMCC maintains and periodically evaluates and revises its mission and goals, the College is required to operate under the guidance of CUNY’s Strategic Framework.
- Assessment of the mission and goals is documented in the Institutional Effectiveness Plan which establishes clear timelines and annual processes. The College engages in annual operational planning, and inventories the assessments conducted along with strategic activities. The CUNY Performance Management Process (PMP) serves as an opportunity to align the strategic plan objective and strategic outcomes with those of the University. Five (5) of the strategic plan outcomes were chosen for prioritization during the 2016-2017 year.
- While the objectives are mapped to the goals, not all outcomes map to the objectives.

### STANDARD I

In the judgment of the team, the institution appears to meet the standard.

- **Significant Accomplishments, Significant Progress, or Exemplary/Innovative Practices:**
  - BMCC is to be commended for their thorough efforts in reviewing trends that impact the college both locally and nationally.
- **Suggestions:**
  - As part of the strategic planning process, seek out and incorporate input into the strategic plan from external stakeholders.
- **Recommendations:** The Team affirms the institution’s recommendations identified in Chapter 11(p. 91) of the self-study document:
  - Establish a committee to review and enhance communication about BMCC’s mission, strategic priorities, and accomplishments, both within the BMCC community as well as to external groups.
- **Requirements: None**

### REQUIREMENT OF AFFILIATION

In the team’s judgment, the institution appears to meet Requirement of Affiliation # or #s 7 & 10

### Standard II: Ethics and Integrity

**Ethics and Integrity are central, indispensable and defining hallmarks of effective higher education institutions. In all activities, whether internal or external, an education institution must be faithful to its mission, honor its contracts and commitments, adhere to its policies and represent itself truthfully.**

Summary of evidence and findings

Based on a review of the self-study and related supporting documents, the College demonstrates a clear commitment to the standards of ethics and integrity. Interviews with college personnel reflect a campus climate in support of academic freedom, diversity and inclusion and appropriate workplace conduct. The documents and interviews are reinforced by system-wide policies. CUNY's Academic Integrity Policy and the Policy on Intellectual Property is reinforced and supported by the College Committee on Academic Freedom. The College's commitment to equity and campus climate is supported by two senior level diversity officers reporting directly to the college president -- both of whom are responsible for training and implementation of initiatives designed to improve campus climate. Through the self-study process, the College acknowledges the challenges associated with providing additional support for research and scholarly inquiry. The team supports the College's effort to address this issue.

#### **Standard II:**

In the judgment of the team, the college appears to meet the standard.

- **Significant accomplishments, significant progress and/or exemplary practices**

Among the innovative practices that support the standard are the Equity and Inclusion and the Safe Zone initiatives. Both projects provide advice, counsel and training to ensure a respectful campus climate. BMCC infuses diversity, race, gender and class discussions across the curriculum through faculty development.

The Faculty Senate oversees academic governance. All matters related to academic programs and advising are heard and deliberated before the Academic Senate. The Senate houses the Curriculum Committee. As one of the initial community college participants in the Careers in Higher Education (COACHE) project, BMCC has taken on the task of responding to the results by charging a committee with making recommendations to the President. The College Senate is reviewing the current governance structure to further ensure transparency and participation by all members of the College community.

- **Recommendations**

Continue to review the recommendations associated with the COACHE study.

Continue to reform the BMCC Governance Structure.

Continue to advance the self-study recommendation to implement an equity initiative to reduce performance gaps among groups of students, increase faculty and staff diversity, and implement practices and policies to ensure that BMCC is a place where everyone can thrive – inside and outside the classroom.

- **Requirements:** None

## REQUIREMENT OF AFFILIATION

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet Requirement of Affiliation # or #s 12,13,14

### **Standard III: Design and Delivery of the Student Learning Experience**

**An institution provides students with learning experiences that are characterized by rigor and coherence of all program, certificate, and degree levels, regardless of instructional modality. All learning experiences, regardless of modality, program pace/schedule, and setting are consistent with higher education expectations.**

#### Summary of Evidence and Findings

Based on a review of the self-study, other institutional documents, and interviews with faculty, staff, students, and others, the team developed the following conclusions relative to this standard:

- Student learning is an institutional priority at BMCC. The institution's educational offerings display academic content, rigor, and coherence that are appropriate to its higher education mission. Faculty, via the Academic Senate, Academic Assessment Committee and the Curriculum Committee, has primary responsibility for academic programs and assessment.
- The College offers a variety of programs and support services to meet the needs of the diverse student body. The College's 45 degree and certificate programs are offered in a variety of delivery formats. Educational offerings and support services are available for students 7 days a week and are offered in traditional on-campus, fully online, and hybrid formats. The vibrant Evening and Weekend Program makes it possible for working students to complete their academic goals while juggling family responsibilities.
- Comprehensive information regarding academic programs and scheduling is available through the College website and catalog. The array of modalities and schedules are implemented without compromising academic content and rigor.
- The BMCC staff and faculty are very passionate about students and their success. BMCC's commitment to student success is confirmed by the number of programs and support services available for students. The College offers general academic support services through various administrative offices and tailored support services through cohort and boutique programs. The largest cohort program, ASAP, enrolls nearly 3,800 students and touts higher graduation rates. These programs have had a positive impact on student success at BMCC.
- In recent years, the College initiated several programs to prepare students for future academic and career endeavors. The Honors Program and student research programs prepare students for transfer to competitive senior institutions. Internships and experiential learning provide students with career development opportunities.

- CUNY adopted Pathways General Education Requirements as a system-wide initiative to create a seamless transfer path for students between CUNY institutions. Initially, the CUNY Pathways initiative was not embraced by BMCC faculty, resulting in an Academic Senate vote for a moratorium. Subsequently, departments successfully integrated the Pathways general education framework into the existing BMCC general education structure. As a result of the Pathways adoption, academic departments have experienced increases in student success.
- BMCC's commitment to student success is also evident in its strategies designed to support students entering the college requiring remediation in developmental math, reading and writing. The faculty are vested in strategies to improve developmental success rates with programs such as accelerated learning, co-requisite models, and supplemental instruction. The College's language and math immersion programs are designed to expedite student enrollment in credit-bearing courses. Enrollment trends and pass rates reflect increasing enrollment and success in these courses which translates to increased number of college-ready students who will have a shortened path the college completion. The College's success in these courses is a testament to the resources and efforts focused on this student population.
- BMCC's commitment to academic rigor is evidenced by the strong commitment to faculty and student research. Full-time faculty are required to participate in scholarly inquiry and are encouraged to provide mentorship for student research opportunities. Faculty are supported in their scholarship endeavors through faculty development opportunities and reassign time for junior faculty. The research focus of BMCC is quite unique among community colleges. Faculty are generally supportive of the culture of research and scholarship, yet express challenges balancing classroom teaching and research.
- The online program accounts for approximately 10 percent of enrollment and the College has an aggressive plan to expand online offerings. The stated goal in the strategic plan is to increase the percentage of online and hybrid courses by 50% per year between 2016 and 2020. The College currently offers two online degree programs that were not reflected in the Middle States Institutional Profile; however, the substantive change document was submitted on February 15, 2018. To support the existing online program, the College provides a variety of support programs for online students. The College is routinely evaluating data related to online student success. In 2016 when the overall success rate of online courses fell below the success rate of web-enhanced and hybrid courses, the College implemented new online student orientation and Starfish early-alert.

### STANDARD III

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet this standard.

- **Significant Accomplishments, Significant Progress, or Exemplary/Innovative Practices:**
  - The College is commended for establishing a college-wide institutional agenda focused on student success with a specific focus on retention and completion.
  -
- **Suggestions: None**

- **Recommendations: None**

The Team affirms the institution's recommendations identified in Chapter 11(p. 91) of the self-study document:

- Enhance collaboration between and integration of AES areas and academic departments to effectively design for student success and implement the College-Wide Retention and Completion Agenda.
- Formalize and implement a comprehensive developmental education reform agenda and evaluation strategy that improves students' successful enrollment in credit bearing courses.
- Support continued development of pedagogical leadership among faculty through the Teaching Academy and CETLS and provide administrative support for faculty to explore strategies to help students succeed in the classroom.
- Develop strategies to improve the recruitment, onboarding, retention, and satisfaction of a highly diverse faculty and staff, including to update faculty and staff handbooks as needed.

- **Requirements: None**

### **REQUIREMENT OF AFFILIATION**

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet Requirement of Affiliation #s 8, 9, 10, and 15.

### **Standard IV: Support of the Student Experience**

Across all educational experiences, settings, levels, and instructional modalities, the institution recruits and admits students whose interests, abilities, experiences, and goals are congruent with its mission and educational offerings. The institution commits to student retention, persistence, completion, and success through a coherent and effective support system sustained by qualified professionals, which enhances the quality of the learning environment, contributes to the educational experience, and fosters student success.

#### Summary of Evidence and Findings

Based on a review of the self-study, other institutional documents, and interviews with faculty, staff, students, and others, the team developed the following conclusions relative to the standard.

The BMCC mission is centered on student success, with four of the five institutional goals directly linked to student success. BMCC strives to be an open access institution that meets the needs of its community. Print and electronic publications provide awareness of the academic experience and essential services at BMCC. Policies and processes regarding how to obtain financial aid, scholarships and grants are on the college website. In addition, BMCC reaches out to students through its Single Stop Office and Emergency Loan Program. The Center for Excellence in Teaching, Learning, and Scholarship (CETLS), with the support of the library, has taken the lead in a college-wide initiative to reduce the cost of textbooks for students through the use of Open Educational Resources (OER). More than 70 faculty

have transitioned their courses to OER, totaling 175 course sections and an estimated more than \$1 million in savings.

The College's student data is protected through FERPA rules and students are made aware of FERPA during orientation. This information is also available on the Registrar's homepage. Electronic records are maintained through CUNY's Computing and Information Services Security Policies and Procedures.

BMCC's Academic Advisement and Transfer Center (AATC) is designed to enhance the successful achievement of students' educational goals. Academic advisement is mandatory each semester. The College and students value the role advisors play in students' academic success in both the general and cohort programs. A low faculty to advisor ratio model in cohort programs as well as academic program mapping contributes to degree completion.

The AATC is committed to offering BMCC students a wide array of transfer opportunities. There are student articulation agreements with four-year institutions within the CUNY and SUNY systems, private institutions as well as Sister College transfers to Smith and Mount Holyoke Colleges.

BMCC has clear policies and procedures in place regarding evaluation and acceptance of transfer credits, and credits awarded through experiential learning, prior nonacademic learning, competency-based assessment and other alternative learning approaches.

BMCC strives to improve degree completion, graduation and student transfer rates. BMCC provides outreach opportunities to new students through a number of initiatives including Cohort Program Orientation, Getting Prepared to Start (GPS) and First Year Experience (FYE), all orientation programs that acclimate students to BMCC. Extensive information is made available to students explaining advisement and registration.

The College offers programs for students who are not yet ready for college-level work. These include programs for students whose native language is not English, for students who need to boost their math abilities and acceleration programs that help students prepare for college level courses. In addition, the BMCC Learning Academy (BLA) and the Accelerated Study in Associate Programs (ASAP) are cohort-based programs that are devised to promote affordability and accessibility.

The Learning Resource Center (LRC) offers academic support services to strengthen academic skills and meet student learning needs. In addition, the LRC coordinates the Supplemental Instruction (SI) program which provides individualized tutoring in the classroom. The LRC provides special support for students in developmental skills courses through dedicated labs, including the Math Lab, the Basic Skills English Lab, the ESL Lab the Reading lab, and the Derfner Lab for Speech.

The College values community engagement and business development. Internships and The Experiential Learning (IEL) Office provide students with a range of educational opportunities that align with the College's strategic plan.

The College acknowledges its students' engagement outside the classroom through the Co-Curricular Transcript which recognizes student achievement in ten categories. It is a representation of the student's education, both inside and outside of the classroom, distinguishing a student's comprehensive record of participation, achievements and fosters the total development of the student.

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet the standard.

**Significant Accomplishments:**

The team would like to commend the College for providing comprehensive and flexible student support to a diverse student body. The students remarked on the quality of support and interaction with the staff and faculty as leading to their success as well as feeling valued at BMCC. A culture of engaging students in research, leadership development and peer mentoring is evident in the commitment from College leadership, faculty, and staff.

**Suggestions:**

- Over the years, the College has purchased a number of software programs that have functional overlap. This situation has created redundancy and inefficiencies that should be addressed on an institution-wide level.

**Recommendations:** The Team affirms the institution's recommendations identified in Chapter 11(p. 91) of the self-study document:

- Continue to improve the assessment of programs supporting student experiences by employing a systemic approach to grow and sustain a culture of assessment that will lead to continuous improvement of student services.

**Requirements: None**

**REQUIREMENT OF AFFILIATION #s 8 and 10**

In the team's judgment, the institution appear to meet Requirement of Affiliation #s 8 and 10.

**Standard V: Educational Effectiveness Assessment**

**Assessment of student learning and achievement demonstrates that the institution's students have accomplished educational goals consistent with their programs of study, degree level, the institution's mission, and appropriate expectations for institutions of higher education.**

Summary of Evidence and Findings

Based on a review of the self-study, institutional documents, and interviews with faculty, administrators, staff, and students, the team developed the following conclusions relative to the standard.

Assessment at BMCC is rooted in the Mission and the Strategic Plan which are centered on student success. General education assessment is addressed through the CUNY Pathways Model approved in 2013 and in the institutional general education model approved in 2006. In order to bring these two models into congruence, a "crosswalk" was developed.

The CUNY Pathways Model is a well-developed, systematic approach to general education assessment. Three required core areas of 12 credits address English Composition, Life and Physical Sciences, and Mathematics and Quantitative Reasoning. An additional flexible core of 18 credits complement the required Core. Each of these areas has learning outcomes that support the acquisition of the particular area. A drawback to the Pathways Initiative is the inability of AAS programs to meet the 30-credit Pathways requirement. Faculty stated that the CUNY Pathways model is used mainly to ensure that students meet general education course requirements.

BMCC also has a set of institutional general educational outcomes that include a set of seven knowledge areas and skills (Goals): communication, quantitative and scientific reasoning, information and technological literacy, values, as well as concepts in social sciences and humanities. A learning outcome has been written for each of these areas (Catalog, p. 18.) The seven general education learning outcomes are listed on each syllabus and at least one must be checked as relevant to the course.

Each syllabus template includes course specific learning outcomes (up to five), general education outcomes (at least one general education learning outcome must be checked) and the CUNY model with all of the Common Core and Flexible Core learning outcomes. The syllabi include directions that a course in the specific core area must meet learning outcomes identified in that particular core area. The template assures that both the BMCC institutional learning outcomes as well as the CUNY Core learning outcomes are addressed. Assessment of general education is through the Liberal Arts Program Review.

Learning outcomes assessment at BMCC is primarily addressed through course assessment. Faculty are engaged in substantive course assessment and were able to offer many examples of change based on assessment. Course assessment, however, is not usually linked to Program assessment but appears to be a separate and distinct process. Program Reviews use course assessment results for learning outcomes assessment.

In addition to course assessments, Academic Program Reviews are conducted every five years. This robust process includes learning outcomes assessment, success outcomes assessment and an external evaluation. The review ends with a five-year improvement plan so that the next review can address the recommendations from the previous review. There are also milestone events during the five years that keep the process on track. The institution views Academic Program Reviews as their primary vehicle for program learning outcomes assessment. CLOs are mapped to the PLOs in 50% of the programs. Maps are currently being developed for all programs.

Program Learning Outcomes are not published in the catalog and are not readily available to students. The PLOs are outlined in Planning Point and in department documents.

While assessment occurs in all academic departments, the frequency and approach varies and does not include the assessment of all PLOs on an annual basis. The lack of longitudinal data makes it difficult to identify trends. Additionally, the absence of a fully institutionalized, consistent approach to program learning outcomes assessment has resulted in program learning outcomes assessment lacking focus and coordination.

Student evaluation tools include essays, exams and student presentations. Rubrics are used for grading. Faculty could easily identify numerous approaches to student evaluation that reflected student engagement, such as student historical research with a classroom presentation.

Academic assessment at BMCC is faculty driven. An Academic Assessment Committee supports assessment in all academic departments. This committee is focused on suggesting policy and procedural changes. A representative from each department sits on this committee. In addition, an extensive faculty development program supports assessment efforts.

The institution has acknowledged the importance of improving key indicators of student success and graduation rates have been slowly but steadily improving. The 2014 cohort graduation rate was 20.3%, up from 18.47% for the 2012 cohort. Additionally a number of metrics that support graduation rates, such as pass rates in developmental courses and reduced D and failing grades (DFWI rates) in targeted gateway courses are a focus for the College.

Non-academic units which include administrative, educational, and student support units have developed an assessment process that is mainly focused on process indicators and unit functions For example, in HR, an outcome reads, “Provide all new hires with a link to the new hire packet immediately etc.” Learning outcomes are infused into some areas such as the ALC and the Library.

Of note are annual Assessment Days where faculty and staff gather to discuss their assessment results. Both faculty and staff continually commented about how assessment conversation is pervasive throughout the institution.

#### **STANDARD V**

In the team’s judgment, the institution appears to meet this standard.

##### **Significant accomplishments**

CUNY Pathways is a systemic, efficient, and systematic approach to general education assessment that provides clear direction and a well-defined process. It promotes transferability facilitating the students’ ability to complete a baccalaureate degree if so desired.

**Suggestions:** None

##### **Recommendations:**

Implement an institutional structure for program learning outcomes assessment that aligns all assessment components and results in effective and efficient program and learning outcomes assessment.

Utilize outcomes data for instructional improvement and resource allocation.

**Requirements:** None

#### **Requirements of Affiliation**

In the team’s judgment, the institution appears to meet Requirements of Affiliation 8, 9, 10

#### **STANDARD VI: PLANNING, RESOURCES, AND INSTITUTIONAL IMPROVEMENT**

The institution's planning processes, resources, and structures are aligned with each other and are sufficient to fulfill its mission and goals, to continuously assess and improve its programs and services, and to respond effectively to opportunities and challenges.

## Summary of Evidence and Findings

Based on a review of the self-study, other institutional documents, and interviews with faculty, staff, students, and others, the team developed the following conclusions relative to this standard:

- Institutional strategic goals and objectives are integrated as part of CUNY's Strategic Framework.
- CUNY utilizes a performance management process (PMP) that links planning and goal setting by the University.
- Institutional progress of key performance indicators is documented on an annual basis.
- Robust and significant campus participation in the strategic planning process resulted in a new mission statement and strategic plan.
- Given the enrollment and tuition increases experienced by BMCC, the CUNY Community College operating funding model has positioned the College very well financially from an annual operating budget perspective.
- A significant part of BMCC's financial operations are controlled by CUNY including the establishment of annual budget targets and the negotiation of labor contracts.
- BMCC does not have a separate independent financial audit as it is not a separate legal entity; therefore, audited financial statements are conducted at the University level.
- Institutional planning for facilities and infrastructure capital needs is the primary responsibility of the CUNY Office of Capital Facilities Planning, Construction and Management which is also responsible for CUNY's capital construction and capital program.

### STANDARD VI

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet this standard.

- **Significant Accomplishments, Significant Progress, or Exemplary/Innovative Practices:**
  - New institutional strategic plan, "Reaching Greater Levels", completed February 2016 included a new mission statement.
  - Five institutional goals aligned with the mission statement, four directly associated with student success incorporated as part of strategic plan along with twenty strategic planning outcomes.
  - Five of the strategic planning outcomes were selected as institutional priorities. Progress was reported on those priorities both internally to the College and externally to CUNY. Each year, a new set of outcomes will be selected for reporting.
  - BMCC recently implemented a comprehensive on-line institutional assessment model (Planning Point) that will help guide planning, assessment, and resource allocation.
  - Preventive maintenance related projects generally originate at the campus level and are funded as part of the operating budget process.
  - BMCC is focused on reducing its carbon footprint and maintains a series of dashboards to track usage. In the past few years, the College has invested substantial resources in energy conservation projects that has generated significant energy savings.

- Created an annual Information Technology Master Plan and a Student Technology Fee Plan that is linked to resource allocation and assessed on an annual basis.
- **Suggestions:**
  - Continue efforts to acquire additional space to meet increased student enrollment and student and staff needs as well as to provide opportunities to address critical maintenance items as necessary. Part of that effort would include re-engaging and completing the Facility Master planning process that was previously initiated.
  - The College’s Resource Development Annual Report should be more fully developed to demonstrate the linkage between planning and resource allocation.
- **Recommendations:**
  - The team supports the self-study recommendation to continue to enhance the resource allocation process to ensure improved alignment and coordination of all planning efforts, including operational, enrollment management, and technology planning, with the College’s strategic plan. This process should include a more robust, systematic and integrated annual assessment aligned with resource allocation for Administrative, Educational, and Student Support unit’s as well as fully embracing and utilizing PlanningPoint.
- **Requirements:**
  - None

**REQUIREMENT OF AFFILIATION #**

In the team's judgment, the institution *appears* to meet Requirement of Affiliation #11.

**Standard VII: Governance, Leadership and Administration**

**The institution is governed and administered in a manner that allow it to realize its stated mission and goals in a way that effectively benefits the institution, its students, and the other constituencies it serves. Even when supported by or affiliated with governmental, corporate, religious, educational system, or other unaccredited organizations, the institution has education as its primary purpose and it operates as an academic institution with appropriate autonomy.**

Summary of Evidence and Findings

The authority of BMCC is established by the state of New York and placed under the auspices and governance of the City University of New York – CUNY. The role and responsibilities of the CUNY Board of Trustees, the Chancellor and the College president is codified by the CUNY by-laws and NY state law. The stated goal of the university system (CUNY) is to function as an integrated system. However, the President of BMCC has the authority and the autonomy to carry-out the College’s goals given the unique

character and mission. The CUNY performance management process (PMP) serves as the link between the broad university goals and objectives and the college's performance.

The bi-cameral structure within the college is designed to provide wide representation into the policies and regulatory matters related to curriculum, educational policies, student matters and degree granting requirements. Findings from the report on Shared Governance and Leadership and the Provost's Report raised concerns which resulted in the College president appointing 3 committees. The committee recommended a review of the BMCC Governance Plan which was last reviewed in 2010.

Additional documents in support of the governing structure of BMCC are: the PSC-CUNY Contract, the faculty handbook, the student handbook and the Higher Education Officer Handbook. The BMCC Institutional Effectiveness Plan outlines the integrated model used to determine the degree to which planning, assessment, resource allocation and CUNY's Performance Management Processes are central to the development and submission of the College's budget.

### **Standard VII**

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet the standard

#### **Suggestion**

BMCC should complete the review and recommendation for the Governance Plan.

**Recommendation:** The team supports the institution's recommendations identified in Chapter 11 (p. 91) of the self-study document.

Continue to improve the quality of the BMCC website, including updating and improving faculty pages and creating a webpage that clearly illustrates the College's organizational and governance structures.

**Requirements: None**

### **Conclusion**

The team thanks the institution for its support and openness throughout this process. As a reminder, the next steps in the evaluation process are as follows:

1. The institution may respond to any factual errors within 10 days after receiving this draft
2. The team chair will upload the document to the Middle States portal after the 10 days.
3. The institution will have the opportunity to provide a formal written Institutional Response addressed to the Commission pursuant to the previously provided timeline and instructions.
4. The team Chair submits a Confidential Brief to the Commission, summarizing the team report and conveying the team's proposal for accreditation action.
5. The Commission's Committee on Evaluation Reports carefully reviews the institutional self-study document, the evaluation team report, the institution's formal response and the Chair's Confidential Brief to formulate a proposed action to the Commission.

6. The full Commission, after considering information gained in the preceding steps, takes formal accreditation action and notifies the institution.